

Sample Peer Feedback [grades pertain to peer feedback, not the outlines themselves

- Sample 1 / Peer Feedback / A
- Sample 2 / Peer Feedback / A
- Sample 3 / Peer Feedback / B
- Sample 4 / Peer Feedback / C
- Sample 5 / Peer Feedback / F

Sample 1 / Student Feedback to Peer's Outline / Score: A

Student Name
Dr. Marchbanks
ENGL 374
Term paper Outline
Intro

- Introduce films including main themes and big ideas from both
- **Thesis:** Both films displayed the internal struggles of people with disabilities that is not often known because society tends to focus on their disability rather than their human experience. Both films used similar plots to convey this through the characters everyday struggles, relationships and conflicts with other characters and themselves.

Commented [CTM1]: This is clearly stated, and good.

The Heart is a lonely Hunter (1968) Robert Ellis Miller

- A film about a deaf- mute man John and his story of life with his disability. Attempting to connect with people while not being easily accepted and struggling to convey his thoughts. John's life proves to be a difficult one and his true struggle is not his disability but the loneliness and isolation as a result of his disability. His rejection from others creates a lonely world for John to live in while simultaneously striving to be a good friend and person. John's story displays struggles of those with disabilities also battling very personal and regular everyday struggles as every able-bodied person experiences.

Commented [CTM2]: This is an interesting point, but it also seems like it could take away from the direct struggles of deaf-muteness if you use this line in your essay. It doesn't add much so I would avoid it.

John and Anton's life throughout the film:

- John and his role in Anton's life as his friend and acting as a caretaker.
 1. Helping Anton when he wanders in the middle of the night and eats the sweets out of the window.
 2. John moving to a different town to be near Anton to visit and bring him gifts.
- John and his struggles throughout his daily life, living life on his own and attempting to find connections with people who accept him.
 1. Making friends with people in town like the drunk friend at the bar, doctor, Mink.
 2. Struggling to communicate and receive respect or others questioning his capabilities. Ex. Waitresses, Mink's first meeting, Receptionists
 3. His hardship as a deaf man who is isolated from a society that is not heavily accepting of people with his disability. Ex. Game of chess cancelled.
- Feelings of isolation and difficulty throughout his life.
 1. Losing Anton while he faced isolation and loneliness, creating a difficult situation for him, while simultaneously not being able to communicate effectively with those around him.

Commented [CTM3]: I wouldn't say that the chess game being cancelled had to do with his disability. A stronger example would be when the girl calls him "dummy" and won't accept him.

2. Taking his own life and bringing awareness to those who care for him about his struggles apart from his disability.

The Village (2004) M. Knight Shymalan

- The Village is a story about a small village of people who have attempted to create a safe place for their citizens to live. The film mostly follows the story of a young blind woman, Ivy. She befriends another young man Noah with a mental disability of his own. The story follows the village members and a love story between Ivy and another character. However, throughout the film Ivy and Noah's disabilities play a major role in the story and character development. Ivy and Noah give another example of internal struggles for those with disabilities and how that is viewed and treated by a society not accepting of those with disabilities.

Commented [CTM4]: This phrasing implies that blindness is also a mental disability

Ivy and Noah's different treatment of each other and by other Village members.

- Ivy and her role as Noah's friend and partially caretaker.
 1. Playing games with him throughout the film.
 2. Noah and Ivy's relationship interpreted differently to both.
 3. Noah's internal struggle with his rejection from Ivy.
- Noah's actions after attempting to kill Lucius.
 1. The Village's treatment of him in the quiet room.
 2. His running in the woods and his interaction with Ivy, not understanding his actions.
- Ivy and her capabilities compared to Noah and the different treatment.
 1. Allowing Ivy to venture into the woods.
 2. The treatment of Noah after he misbehaves, the stick whacking or the stabbing.

Commented [CTM5]: Your thesis states that both films are about society focusing on the disability rather than the character, but to me it seems like their secluded society focuses on their character and pays little mind to the disabilities, and this too causes problems.

Both Films

- People lacking to see the internal struggles of each person with disabilities in each film
 1. John taking his own life and his feelings of loneliness without his friend, moving and after his friend passes away.
 2. Noah stabbing Lucius and his interpretation of his and Ivy's relationship, deeper feeling than he was able to convey or understand.
- The treatment of people with mental disabilities rather than physical
 1. The treatment of John versus Anton throughout the film: Anton put in a facility, staring in restaurants, people talking over him etc. Versus John who while having a difficult time was listened to and given more respect as a person.
 2. Ivy and her capabilities rather than Noah, she was sent into the woods because she was considered capable, put in charge of children because she was responsible. Noah punished for "bad behavior", put in the quiet room and ignored after the stabbing.
- DSR culture and treatment of people with disabilities

Commented [CTM6]: There is an important distinction between this and what the thesis states. I would modify the thesis to emphasize this point.

Conclusion

- Summarize and collect main themes from both films.
- Discuss overall representations and how each of these movies may have contributed.

Commented [CTM7]: He did get into a fight, and his bad behavior left unchecked led him to attempt murder. I would think the problem here isn't that they treated Noah differently because of his disability, but rather didn't treat him correctly by taking it into account.

Sample 2 / Student Feedback to Peer's Outline / Score: A

Student Name
Dr. Marchbanks
ENGL 374
July 20, 2022

No Place in Society: An Analysis of *The Village* and *The Heart is a Lonely Hunter* (title WIP)
Essay Outline

I. Thesis Statement

The films *The Village* and *The Heart is a Lonely Hunter* both agree that society does not adequately address mental and physical disabilities.

- Mostly address mental disabilities, but physical disabilities are depicted as well. Often in reality, these two go hand in hand.
- 1. Noah was never really held accountable for his actions, he never learned that violence was wrong / that he should not do it. On top of that, the village did not have the resources to monitor or teach Noah right from wrong.
- 2. Spiros died in a hospital because of an infection. He should never have been committed at all. Spiros should have stayed with Mr. Singer.

II. Main Points and Evidence

Comparison between Noah and Spiros

- Noah and Spiros were both mentally disabled
 - o Neither understand right from wrong nor have a sense of morality
 - Trouble following the rules
 - o Neither can control their impulses
 - o Destructive behavior is a danger to those around them
- Both were caught committing crimes
 - o Noah: attacking children, stabbing Lucius, wearing the costume (?)
 - o Spiros: breaking a glass window to steal sweets from a display
- Both died
 - o These men could never fully assimilate with the society that bred them
 - o The lack of resources and empathy extinguished any chance of a "normal" life for these two
 - Noah: Instead of properly caring for Noah, he was charged with scaring the townsfolk into staying in the village. This further isolated him from ever truly connecting or caring about his fellow neighbors.
 - Spiros: Because he was not allowed to live with Singer, seemingly the only person to really understand him, his health conditions got worse.

How does the community deal with these men?

- Noah is believed to be 100% innocent. He is not treated as equal to everyone else due to his disability
 - o Lack of accountability meant that Noah never had to learn right from wrong. This is what leads him to stabbing Lucius out of jealousy.

Commented [CTM8]: Since the requirements state we need to incorporate two more films as well, I think you should cut out the film names from the essay title. Perhaps just "An Analysis of Intersecting Disability in Film"

Commented [CTM9]: The Heart is a Lonely Hunter spends most of its time on Singer, with Spiros being one of the sub plots.

Commented [CTM10]: I don't quite understand this. Is it saying that people with physical disabilities tend to have mental disabilities? I don't know if that's true

Commented [CTM11]: I think that this would also give a bad outcome, as it shouldn't be Singers responsibility to take care of Spiros. The problem is inadequate care of Spiros in the hospital, or the infection was just inevitable and not really related to the mental disability.

Commented [CTM12]: This is a good point - you should explain why this is because it's shown in both films (The Village having a more obvious example), and directly connects to the thesis of how society isn't adequately addressing mental disabilities.

Commented [CTM13]: This isn't what happened. Are you referring to when he attacked Lucius for being in love with Ivy, and then was punished? The elders are the ones who scare people into staying in the village to protect their secluded society.

Commented [CTM14]: I like how you make it clear that the films depict two ways we treat people with mental disabilities (The way we do in reality versus with total equality), and both are ineffective.

- o Noah never recognized the harm in subjecting the townspeople to isolation from society. People were sick and were unable to get medicine because of this isolation.
- Spiros *does* receive punishment – he is required to stay in a mental institute. He cannot stay with Mr. Singer, even though it is clear what is best for him.
- Spiros’ cousin does not think of him as a person but rather a liability. This family member would prefer he rot in a hospital than to look after him.
 - o The problem is swept to someone else
- DSR: A Mad Fight: Psychiatry and Disability Activism
 - o “they believe mainstream psychiatry over exaggerates psychic pathology and over enforces psychic conformity in the guise of diagnostic labeling and treatment— which all too often comes in the form of forced or manipulated hospitalizations, restraints, seclusions, and medications” (Lewis, 103)
 - o Good news to mention towards end: “Mad Pride activists have been particularly successful in increasing consumer participation in treatment planning and facility governance. In addition, they have gained increasing respect for the work developing peer-run treatment alternatives” (Lewis, 108).

How does the treatment of these people reflect on society?

- A Patch of Blue:
 - o Selina D’Arcy attempts to walk through the street and is very clearly struggling. A sea of people ignores her plight, turning a blind eye on someone in need. Only two strangers in the entire film ever lend a helping hand to her.
 - Society can do more to help disabled individuals in need rather than leaving them with little to no help at all.
- *The Village*
 - o Despite her blindness, Ivy is known as being even more capable than other able-bodied people in the village. This is likely due to the environment she was raised in. The wealthy and prestigious Walker family gave her the resources that she needed in order to properly function. It may be assumed that Noah’s family did not have the same resources.
- *The Heart is a Lonely Hunter*
 - o The court rules that Spiros is unfit to live with normal people, and that he should stay in a mental institute. Instead of teaching Spiros right from wrong, he is shoved into what is essentially a jail to isolate him from society.
- Being There
 - o It is made very clear that Chance is in no shape to live in this world on his own. If someone in his position were real, society would have no place for him. There are no resources in place for someone who is that old with no education, no support system, and limited cognitive ability. While the film is mostly comedic in nature, it serves as a stark reminder that there are not enough resources out there for people with mental disabilities.
- *DSR Baynton*
 - o “the concept of disability has been used to justify discrimination against other groups by attributing disability to them” (Baynton, 18).
 - o “Disability arguments were prominent in justifications of slavery in the early to mid-nineteenth century and of other forms of unequal relations between white and

Commented [CTM15]: This is a great example to include

Commented [CTM16]: This one feels like a bit of a stretch if you don't have a specific scene to point to. Perhaps you should specifically bring up the part where he says he has no claim to the house while the attorneys are questioning him. The talk that they had was not fair, and the attorneys took advantage of him because of his disability.

black Americans after slavery's demise. The most common disability argument for slavery was simply that African Americans lacked sufficient intelligence to participate or compete on an equal basis in society with white Americans" (Baynton, 20).

- "While these arguments were often contradictory, incoherent, or simply ludicrous, disability was central to all of them" (Baynton, 22).

Things to incorporate when writing the final essay

- Remember to talk about the ideas from *A Rhetoric of Film* and to properly tie those ideas together with the thesis statement
 - Answer the question: how did the author use specific elements of film to portray the thesis?
- Can possibly address counterarguments
 - Maybe the films aren't critiques of society, but rather critiques of individuals
 - Maybe the portrayal of disability in these films is more damaging than nurturing
- Concluding Paragraph
 - Restate main points, tie everything together, end with a strong note
 -

Works Cited

- [1]
- [2]
- [3]
- [4]

Sample 3 / Student Feedback to Peer's Outline / Score: B

Intersecting Disabilities Essay Outline

Commented [J117]: Two thumbs up overall

Reference (This part is just for me)

Path 2 Films

- Robert Ellis Miller's *The Heart Is a Lonely Hunter* (1968)
- M. Knight Shyamalan's *The Village* (2004)

Path 1 Films

- J. Charles Haydon's *Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde* (1920)
- Tod Browning's *Freaks* (1932)
- George Cukor's *Gaslight* (1944)
- Jean Negulesco's *Johnny Belinda* (1948)
- Guy Green's *A Patch of Blue* (1965)
- Hal Ashby's *Being There* (1979)
- Lars von Trier's *Dancer in the Dark* (2000)
- Richard Glatzer's and Wash Westmoreland's *Still Alice* (2014)

Instructions

- Consider the ways in which the two films assigned to your Path 2 group engage a similar topic or theme. Do their individual approaches constitute a meeting of the minds, or do they differ widely in their agendas and conclusions? You must find some creative way of weaving these films together into a tightly organized, narrowly defined, debatable position--one which concludes that the two works achieve something either similar or dissimilar.
- An opening paragraph and a concluding paragraph that bookend your argument with a cinematic context that refers to a total of 2-6 Path 1 films assigned in this course. (You may also weave references to Path 1 films into body paragraphs to provide counterpoints to claims made about your Path 2 films.
- A specific, debatable thesis statement about your both Path 2 films and their representation of disability concerns. This should appear in your opening paragraph.
- Analysis of 2-3 scenes per Path 2 film which: 1) demonstrates familiarity with film techniques and concepts covered in *The Rhetoric of Film*, and 2) discusses the significance of these filmmaking choices. Always tie conclusions back to your debatable thesis.
- Inclusion of ideas paraphrased and/or quoted from three different essays in *The Disability Studies Reader*
- A Works Cited page that lists all essays used from the DSR, both Path 2 films, and any Path 1 films referenced in the essay.
- Employ MLA formatting for headers, title, citations, and Works Cited page. Please note the correct MLA formatting in this shorter, sample paper. Essays should be 5-6 pages in length.

Commented [J118]: You need to do this still

Structure (This is the actual outline)

Intro

- Prompt: Do the path 2 films achieve the same conclusion about intersecting disabilities, and handle the topic in the same way?
- Thesis: Both films portray challenges of living with those with mental disabilities and demonstrate that while these challenges can be overcome through understanding (understanding gained from the lens of their physically disabled loved ones), it is still a burden to engage in a relationship with these people who society is not designed for.
- Both movies demonstrate a hard truth about mental disability – as much as we can try to treat them as equals and normalize their acceptance, they will always be different, and have a hard time finding their place in a society built by and for people unlike them.

Commented [JI19]: Wordy but good

Commented [JI20]: I think the thesis is still strong without this statement

Commented [JI21]: You should write "about people with mental disability". Then when you say "them", it refers to the people and not mental disability

The Heart Is a Lonely Hunter

- Follows the lives of various people in a city whose lives are one way or another touched by John Singer.
- John Singer is a deaf-mute man who moves to this new city to follow his friend, Spiros Antonopoulos. The following are examples of his thoughtfulness.
 - He observes a woman listening to music, then he buys her a record for music that brings her joy and plays it for her in their home. This draws the teen in to have a conversation with him, and they begin to become friends.
 - He meets a drunk low-life and helps him get medical help, as well as a place to stay, and an ear for him to vent his frustrations. This helps him get his life back on track and get a job.
 - He assists a doctor in communicating with a deaf patient of his, and also shares a great secret that the doctor has cancer and will soon die.
 - He takes care of his friend Spiros by bringing him candy and company. After the passing of Spiros, Singer kills himself, as he cannot bear the grief.
- Spiros Antonopoulos is a mentally disabled deaf-mute person who must be brought into a hospital for the mentally disabled because of the severity of his condition. He breaks into a bakery to eat cake in the middle of the night (and is arrested). He also ignored his best friend's pleas to leave a meal because he was running short on time, and it seems like his decision-making is centered on food. Spiros provides friendship to Singer but often acts selfishly.
- In A Patch of Blue, we see that a kind man provides the blind Selina with the help she needs to be happy and live a fulfilling life. Signer never receives assistance in this way, and his death would have been avoided if those resources were present.

Commented [JI22]: Struggle to control impulses, parallels with Noah's character in the village

Commented [JI23]: Consider using the scene where Selina is able to cross the street on her own vs when she struggled to do so

Commented [JI24]: Nice

The Village

- Follows a small community hidden in a secluded area of the woods created by grieving adults looking to escape crime in modern society. Conflict is created by a mentally
- Noah Percy is a mentally disabled young man who shares a strong bond with Ivy Walker. When Ivy decides to pronounce her love for another man (Lucius Hunt) in the village, Noah attempts to kill him. Noah later dresses as a monster and goes out to attack Ivy trying to scare her back home instead of going to collect medicinal supplies to save Lucius. He ends up dying after Ivy, believing he is some beast, tricks him into falling into a pit. Lucius acts selfishly and causes a large deal of trouble for the society and Ivy.
- Ivy Walker is a young, brave, kind, blind woman who shares a strong bond with Noah Percy. Ivy keeps him company and gives him guidance, exemplified by a scene where

Commented [JI25]: Do you think there is a deeper meaning to this scene? Would be an interesting avenue

Commented [JI26]: Did you mean Noah?

she scolds him for getting into a fight, but then proceeds to go easy on his punishment after he swears to never strike someone again. Ivy acts selflessly and is a great benefit to the community.

- Noah is a detriment to the community, while Ivy is a benefit to it.
- Noah's existence in the society causes problems because of a lack of knowledge of how to treat him – the society is ill-equipped to provide help to a person with a mental illness, and for this reason his moral compass is askew.
- Another note: Nobody in this society looks down upon the disabled. They are treated equally as everybody else. Perhaps important to note that equity is more helpful than equality.

Outro:

- In both films, a person with a physical disability struggle to deal with their relationship with a person with a mental disability.
- In The Village, these struggles are due to a lack of resources that the society provides for dealing with such an ailment as mental disability.
- In The Heart Is a Lonely Hunter, the struggles are due to a lack of resources for helping out Singer – everyone relies on him, and nobody gives back to him.

Commented [J127]: Even though he promised not to strike someone again, Noah stabs Lucius. This could be a strong talking point for how Noah's particular disability affects himself and those around him

Commented [J128]: Can mention what differences in upbringing these two had that could have caused this difference

Commented [J129]: Nice

Sample 4 / Student Feedback to Peer's Outline / Score: C

Student Name
Dr. Marchbanks
ENGL 374
Term paper Outline

Intro

- Introduce films including main themes and big ideas from both
- **Thesis:** Both films displayed the internal struggles of people with disabilities that is not often known because society tends to focus on their disability rather than their human experience. Both films used similar plots to convey this through the characters everyday struggles, relationships and conflicts with other characters and themselves.

Commented [JI30]: Clear and debatable

Commented [JI31]: Change to "are" instead of "is"

Commented [JI32]: Good logical flow

The Heart is a lonely Hunter (1968) Robert Ellis Miller

- A film about a deaf- mute man John and his story of life with his disability. Attempting to connect with people while not being easily accepted and struggling to convey his thoughts. John's life proves to be a difficult one and his true struggle is not his disability but the loneliness and isolation as a result of his disability. His rejection from others creates a lonely world for John to live in while simultaneously striving to be a good friend and person. John's story displays struggles of those with disabilities also battling very personal and regular everyday struggles as every able-bodied person experiences.

Commented [JI33]: I would mention that others thought of John as being their friends, but he never opened up to those people. They all relied on him for their problems, but never stopped to ask about what his own problems

John and Anton's life throughout the film:

- John and his role in Anton's life as his friend and acting as a caretaker.
 3. Helping Anton when he wanders in the middle of the night and eats the sweets out of the window.
 4. John moving to a different town to be near Anton to visit and bring him gifts.
- John and his struggles throughout his daily life, living life on his own and attempting to find connections with people who accept him.
 4. Making friends with people in town like the drunk friend at the bar, doctor, Mink.
 5. Struggling to communicate and receive respect or others questioning his capabilities. Ex. Waitresses, Mink's first meeting, Receptionists
 6. His hardship as a deaf man who is isolated from a society that is not heavily accepting of people with his disability. Ex. Game of chess cancelled,
- Feelings of isolation and difficulty throughout his life.
 3. Losing Anton while he faced isolation and loneliness, creating a difficult situation for him, while simultaneously not being able to communicate effectively with those around him.
 4. Taking his own life and bringing awareness to those who care for him about his struggles apart from his disability.

Commented [JI34]: Could use some tweaking to connect to thesis

Commented [JI35]: I'd be interested in learning about the inner turmoil that John must have gone through. Why does John have this internal struggle when he has people who really like him? Mink, the doctor, the drunk etc.

The Village (2004) M. Knight Shymalan

- *The Village* is a story about a small village of people who have attempted to create a safe place for their citizens to live. The film mostly follows the story of a young blind woman, Ivy. She befriends another young man Noah with a mental disability of his own. The story follows the village members and a love story between Ivy and another character. However, throughout the film Ivy and Noah's disabilities play a major role in the story and character development. Ivy and Noah give another example of internal struggles for

Commented [JI36]: As evidence, you can refer to the very last scene where Mink and the doctor meet at the tombstone

Commented [JI37]: Not sure if we need a summary of the movie, maybe just shorten this section if you plan to keep it.

those with disabilities and how that is viewed and treated by a society not accepting of those with disabilities.

Ivy and Noah's different treatment of each other and by other Village members.

- Ivy and her role as Noah's friend and partially caretaker.
 4. Playing games with him throughout the film.
 5. Noah and Ivy's relationship interpreted differently to both.
 6. Noah's internal struggle with his rejection from Ivy.
- Noah's actions after attempting to kill Lucius.
 3. The Village's treatment of him in the quiet room.
 4. His running in the woods and his interaction with Ivy, not understanding his actions.
- Ivy and her capabilities compared to Noah and the different treatment.
 3. Allowing Ivy to venture into the woods.
 4. The treatment of Noah after he misbehaves, the stick whacking or the stabbing.

Both Films

- People lacking to see the internal struggles of each person with disabilities in each film
 3. John taking his own life and his feelings of loneliness without his friend, moving and after his friend passes away.
 4. Noah stabbing Lucius and his interpretation of his and Ivy's relationship, deeper feeling than he was able to convey or understand.
- The treatment of people with mental disabilities rather than physical
 3. The treatment of John versus Anton throughout the film: Anton put in a facility, staring in restaurants, people talking over him etc. Versus John who while having a difficult time was listened to and given more respect as a person.
 4. Ivy and her capabilities rather than Noah, she was sent into the woods because she was considered capable, put in charge of children because she was responsible. Noah punished for "bad behavior", put in the quiet room and ignored after the stabbing.
- DSR culture and treatment of people with disabilities

Conclusion

- Summarize and collect main themes from both films.
- Discuss overall representations and how each of these movies may have contributed.

Commented [JI38]: Very strong evidence, but I want to see how you use this to "push your agenda"

Commented [JI39]: Thought provoking!

Commented [JI40]: Make sure to reference 2-6 Path 1 Films! I think for your thesis, *A Patch of Blue* and *Johnny Belinda* are two noteworthy films

Sample 5 / Student Feedback to Peer's Outline / Score: F

Overall I thought your outline was solid and contained a lot of good ideas for the term paper. My only suggestion would be to use some more examples from the movies or even the other films we watched to show how society isn't built for them and how these films may show how that is changing. How these movies display the bigger issues in our society one example could be *A Patch of Blue* and her difficulty getting around in the world as a blind woman. A very solid start and best of luck moving forward!